



ISO/TC 28 Petroleum products and lubricants

Secretary: Paula Watkins, American Petroleum Institute, 1220 L Street NW, Washington, DC 20005, USA
Tel: +1 202 682 8197 Fax: +1 202 962 4797 E-Mail: watkinsp@api.org

ISO/TC 28 N 2259

2006-02-02

To: P-members
O-members
L-members

Copy to: R. Hensel, ISO 14596 PL
A. Samné, ISO/CS

Dear Member,

**Voting results, comments received and resolution of comments on:
ISO/CD 14596, *Petroleum products — Determination of sulfur content —
Wavelength-dispersive X-ray fluorescence spectrometry* [circulated as 28 N 2251]**

Voting on ISO/CD 14596 closed on 2005-08-09. Please find attached the voting results, the comments received, and resolution of the comments, prepared by the project leader, Ralph Hensel (Germany)

A revised text has been prepared and forwarded to ISO/CS for distribution as a DIS.

Yours sincerely

Paula Watkins

Paula Watkins
Secretary to ISO/TC 28

Ballot results on: ISO/CD 14596, Petroleum products — Determination of sulfur content — Wavelength-dispersive X-ray fluorescence spectrometry (28 N 2251)

Date circulated: 2005-05-09

Closing date: 2005-08-09

P-member	Agree	Agree with comments	Do not agree	Abstain	Did not reply
Austria					X
Belgium	X				
China					X
Egypt					X
France		X			
Germany	X				
Iran					X
Israel	X				
Italy					X
Japan					X
Kenya					X
Republic of Korea	X				
Netherlands	X				
Norway					X
Poland					X
Romania					X
Singapore					X
Slovakia	X				
Spain	X				
Sweden	X				X
Switzerland					X
Turkey	X				
UK					X
USA	X				
TOTAL	10	1			13

O-member	Agree	Agree with comments	Do not agree	Abstain
India	X			

Template for comments and secretariat observations

*ISO 3166 Country codes: FR = France

NL = Netherlands

Date: 2006-02-02	Document: ISO/CD 14596
Petroleum products — Determination of sulfur content — Wavelength-dispersive X-ray fluorescence spectrometry	

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹ *See key above	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
FR	4.2	Note	ed	Content of this note is normative	"Note" shall be removed and text shall be presented in the main normative part of the document.	Not accepted – The Note is explanatory and carries only a recommendation.
FR	5.3		te	Other types of stirrers shall be stated in this sub-clause		Noted – Comment will be accommodated by adding, in the last part of the clause, "for example"...
FR	7.2	Formula (1)	te	Formula is wrong. It shall be corrected.	Correct formula (1) is proposed below : $w_{s,2} = \frac{m_C \times w_{s,1}}{m_C + m_o}$	Accepted.
FR	7.2 & 7.3	Formulas	ed	Formulas are numbered, which is useless in the whole document. Indeed, numbers are not used.	Remove numbering of the formulas	Not accepted – ISO editorial style.
FR	8.3	1st paragraph	Te	The setting of the spectrometer mentions that « at least 50 000 counts are counted » This value is not realistic and shall be corrected		Not accepted – Considering measurement time and concentration of the internal standard it should be easily achievable.
FR	11		te	Check the values mentioned to report the results. Indeed, it seems rather peculiar to round to the nearest 0,000 1 % (m/m) for both intervals between 0,001 0 % (m/m) to 0,009 9 % (m/m) and between 0,010 0 % (m/m) to 0,099 0 % (m/m).		Not accepted – It is considered as useful and in line with ISO 4259 to indicate 3 significant digits in the interval 0,010 0 % (m/m) to 0,099 9 % (m/m).
FR	12.2	Table 2		Precision statement should be reevaluated through a new Round Robin Test in the future. Values in this standard are quite high compared to other techniques	Further Round Robin Test shall be carried out. Otherwise relevance of precision data mentioned in the document shall be specified.	Noted.

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

*ISO 3166 Country codes: FR = France

NL = Netherlands

Date: 2006-02-02

Document: ISO/CD 14596

Petroleum products — Determination of sulfur content — Wavelength-dispersive X-ray fluorescence spectrometry

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)																		
MB ¹ *See key above	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted																		
FR	12.2 <i>(French version)</i>	1st paragraph		The paragraph shall be translated		Accepted.																		
NL	7.2	Preparation			Correct the formula as follows: $w_{S,2} = \frac{m_C \times w_{S,1}}{m_C + m_O}$	Accepted.																		
NL	10	Calculation		"Repeat the procedure specified in 9.1"	should be "repeat the procedure specified in 9.2"	Accepted.																		
NL	11	Expression of results		"rounded to the nearest 0,0001 % (m/m) between 0,0010 % (m/m) and 0,0099 % (m/m), to the nearest 0,0001 % (m/m) between 0,0100 % (m/m) and 0,0999 % (m/m), and to the nearest 0,01 % (m/m) between 0,10 % (m/m) and 2,50 % (m/m),"	should be "rounded to the nearest 0,000 1 % (m/m) between 0,001 0 % (m/m) and 0,009 9 % (m/m), to the nearest 0,001 % (m/m) between 0,010 % (m/m) and 0,099 % (m/m), and to the nearest 0,01 % (m/m) between 0,10 % (m/m) and 2,50 % (m/m),"	Not accepted – It is considered as useful to have 3 significant digits in the interval 0,010 0 % (m/m) to 0,099 0 % (m/m).																		
NL	12.2	Reproducibility			The table should be written as: Sulfur content % (m/m) <table style="margin-left: 40px;"> <thead> <tr> <th>Repeatability</th> <th>Reproducibility</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>0,001 0 to</td> <td>0,002 9 0,000 3 0,000 5</td> </tr> <tr> <td>0,003 0 to</td> <td>0,004 9 0,000 6 0,001 0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>0,005 0 to</td> <td>0,009 9 0,001 0 0,002 0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>0,010 to</td> <td>0,029 0,002 0,003</td> </tr> <tr> <td>0,030 to</td> <td>0,049 0,003 0,005</td> </tr> <tr> <td>0,050 to</td> <td>0,099 0,005 0,010</td> </tr> <tr> <td>0,10 to</td> <td>0,99 0,01 0,02</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1,00 to</td> <td>2,50 0,02 0,04</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Repeatability	Reproducibility	0,001 0 to	0,002 9 0,000 3 0,000 5	0,003 0 to	0,004 9 0,000 6 0,001 0	0,005 0 to	0,009 9 0,001 0 0,002 0	0,010 to	0,029 0,002 0,003	0,030 to	0,049 0,003 0,005	0,050 to	0,099 0,005 0,010	0,10 to	0,99 0,01 0,02	1,00 to	2,50 0,02 0,04	Not accepted – It is considered as useful and in line with ISO 4259 to indicate 3 significant digits in the interval 0,010 0 % (m/m) to 0,099 9 % (m/m), hence the table should not be rewritten.
Repeatability	Reproducibility																							
0,001 0 to	0,002 9 0,000 3 0,000 5																							
0,003 0 to	0,004 9 0,000 6 0,001 0																							
0,005 0 to	0,009 9 0,001 0 0,002 0																							
0,010 to	0,029 0,002 0,003																							
0,030 to	0,049 0,003 0,005																							
0,050 to	0,099 0,005 0,010																							
0,10 to	0,99 0,01 0,02																							
1,00 to	2,50 0,02 0,04																							

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.